European Convention on Human Rights
– Commentary –

by

Dr. Dr. Christoph Grabenwarter
Judge at the Austrian Constitutional Court
Professor of Public and International Law
Vienna University of Economics and Business
Institute for European and International Law

C. H. Beck · Hart · Nomos
Helbing Lichtenhahn Verlag
2014
Table of Contents

Preface V
List of Abbreviations XIII
Index of Country Codes XVII
Bibliography XIX

Article 1 – Obligation to respect human rights 1
  I. Rights and freedoms defined in the Convention 2
  II. Personal scope of the Convention 2
      1. Subjects entitled to the rights 2
      2. Parties bound by the Convention 3
  III. Territorial scope of the Convention 6
      1. No accountability for extra-territorial acts of other States 7
      2. Accountability for extra-territorial acts 7
          a) Effective control over an area 8
          b) State agent authority and control 8
          c) Exercise of extra-territorial authority in another Member State’s territory 9
  IV. Temporal scope of the Convention 10

Article 2 – Right to Life 12
  I. Introduction 13
  II. Scope of protection 14
  III. Interferences 15
  IV. Justification 17
  V. Positive obligations 21
      1. Obligation to protect life 21
      2. Organisational and procedural obligations 25

Article 3 – Prohibition of torture 31
  I. Introduction 32
  II. Scope of protection and interferences 32
      1. Torture 32
      2. Inhuman treatment 34
      3. Degrading treatment or punishment 36
  III. No justification of an interference with Article 3 38
  IV. Positive obligations 40
  V. Cases of ill-treatment 41
      1. Police operations 41
      2. Treatment of detainees 42
      3. Expulsion and extradition 45
      4. Ill-treatment by private persons 51

Article 4 – Prohibition of slavery and forced labour 53
  I. Introduction 54
  II. Prohibition of slavery and servitude 54
  III. Prohibition on forced or compulsory labour 55
      1. The term ‘forced or compulsory labour’ 55
      2. Exceptions to Article 4 (3) 56
          a) Work performed during detention 56
          b) Military service 57
          c) Services exacted in case of emergency 57
          d) Normal civic obligations 58
**Table of Contents**

IV. Prohibition on trafficking in human beings 58  
V. Positive obligations 59  

Article 5 – Right to liberty and security 61  
I. Introduction 63  
II. Scope of protection 64  
III. Interferences 65  
IV. Compatibility of deprivations of liberty with Article 5 67  
1. Legal basis 68  
2. Compliance with a procedure prescribed by law 69  
3. The absence of arbitrariness 70  
4. Exceptions to the prohibition of deprivation of liberty 72  
   a) Detention after conviction 72  
   b) Arrest or detention for non-compliance with a lawful court order or a legal obligation 75  
   c) Detention on remand 76  
   d) Detention of a minor 79  
   e) Detention for medical or social reasons 80  
   f) Arrest or detention of foreigners 82  

V. The rights of persons deprived of their liberty 85  
1. Prompt information 85  
2. Speedy proceedings 86  
3. The right to review of lawfulness of arrest or detention 92  
4. The right to compensation 96  
5. Positive obligations 97  

Article 6 – Right to a fair trial 98  
I. Introduction 100  
II. Scope of protection 101  
1. Determination of Civil Rights 101  
2. Determination of a Criminal Charge 108  
III. Guarantees of Article 6 in detail 113  
1. 'Tribunals' 113  
2. Access to an independent and impartial tribunal 127  
3. Fair hearing 134  
4. Length of proceedings 141  
5. Public hearing 145  
6. Special procedural guarantees in criminal proceedings 153  
7. Presumption of innocence 166  

Article 7 – No punishment without law 171  
I. Introduction 172  
II. The scope of Article 7 173  
III. Scope of protection 174  
1. No punishment without law 174  
2. Prohibition of retrospective application of criminal law 175  
3. The requirement of a sufficiently clear legal basis 178  
4. Prohibition of retrospective imposition of heavier penalties 181  

Article 8 – Right to family life 183  
I. Introduction 184  
II. Personal scope 185  
1. Natural persons 185  
2. Legal entities 186  
III. Material scope 186  
1. Private life 186  
   a) Physical and moral integrity 187  
   b) Protection of privacy 189  
   c) Personal autonomy 190
Table of Contents

1. Personal scope 367
2. Material scope 367

III. Interferences 371
1. Deprivation of possessions 371
2. Control of use of property 372
3. Other interferences with the right to property 374

IV. Justification 375
1. Deprivation of possessions 375
2. Control of use of property 381
3. Other interferences with the right to property 383
4. Peaceful enjoyment of possessions 385

V. Positive obligations 385

Article 2 – Right to education 389
I. Introduction 389
II. Right to education 390
1. Scope of protection 390
2. Proportionality of interferences 392
3. Positive obligations 394

III. Right of parents to respect for their convictions 394
1. Scope of protection 394
2. Proportionality of interferences 396

IV. Positive obligations 398

Article 3 – Right to free elections 399
I. Introduction 400
II. Scope of protection 401
1. Personal scope 401
2. Material scope 401
   a) Elections 401
   b) Legislative bodies 402
   c) Voting principles 402
   d) The right to vote and to stand for elections 403
III. Interferences 403

IV. Justification 404
1. General 404
2. Legitimate aim 404
3. Proportionality 405

Protocol No. 4 410

Article 1 – Prohibition of imprisonment for debt 410
I. Introduction 410
II. Scope of protection 410

Article 2 – Freedom of movement 411
I. Introduction 412
II. Scope of protection 412
1. Freedom to choose one’s residence 412
2. Freedom to leave a country 413

III. Interferences 413
IV. Justification 415

Article 3 – Prohibition of expulsion of nationals 418
I. Introduction 418
II. Scope of protection 418
III. Interferences 419
IV. Justification 419
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Article 4 – Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens</td>
<td>421</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>421</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The guarantee of Article 4 of Protocol No. 4</td>
<td>421</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Justification</td>
<td>422</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protocol No. 6</td>
<td>423</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 1 – Abolition of the death penalty</td>
<td>423</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 2 – Death penalty in time of war</td>
<td>423</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protocol No. 7</td>
<td>424</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 1 – Procedural safeguards relating to expulsion of aliens</td>
<td>424</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>424</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Scope of protection</td>
<td>425</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Procedural safeguards under Article 1 of Protocol No. 7</td>
<td>425</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Restrictions of the procedural safeguards</td>
<td>426</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 2 – Right of appeal in criminal matters</td>
<td>428</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>428</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Scope of protection</td>
<td>429</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The guarantee of Article 2 of Protocol No. 7</td>
<td>429</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Exceptions</td>
<td>430</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Offences of a minor character</td>
<td>430</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Trial at first instance by the highest tribunal</td>
<td>431</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Conviction following an appeal against acquittal</td>
<td>431</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 3 – Compensation for wrongful conviction</td>
<td>432</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>432</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Requirements for claiming compensation</td>
<td>433</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Right to compensation</td>
<td>433</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 4 – Right not to be tried or punished twice</td>
<td>435</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>436</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The scope of protection</td>
<td>436</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The guarantee of Article 4 of Protocol No. 7</td>
<td>438</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Exceptions</td>
<td>439</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 5 – Equality between spouses</td>
<td>441</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Scope of protection</td>
<td>441</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Relationship to other Convention guarantees</td>
<td>442</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protocol No. 12</td>
<td>443</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 1 – General prohibition of discrimination</td>
<td>443</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>443</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The scope of Article 1 of Protocol No. 12</td>
<td>444</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protocol No. 13</td>
<td>446</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 1 – Abolition of the death penalty</td>
<td>446</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full text of the European Convention on Human Rights (including Protocols Nos. 1, 4, 6, 7, 12 and 13)</td>
<td>447</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rules of Court (1 July 2013)</td>
<td>483</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex to the Rules of Court (concerning investigations)</td>
<td>528</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice Directions</td>
<td>532</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>545</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>